

Stone Soup Categories		INCLUSION	LEADERSHIP	"BRANDING"	RELEVANCE & VALUE	EVOLUTION & GROWTH	SUSTAINABILITY	COMPETITIVENESS or AGENCY	PARTNERING
Stone 1	Play by the same rules (Lucy)	X	X		X		X	X	
Stone 2	Share and Share Alike (Lucy) - also mutual aid				X	X		X	X
Stone 3	Speak with One Voice (Lucy) see also 7		X	X	X			X	
Stone 4	Respect My Authority (Lucy)		X			X	X		
Stone 4.1	Defending the Faith					X	X	X	X
Stone 5	Our goal is the Academic Interfederation. National federations, etc. are means to that end. (David Walker) See 19, 7, 6, 9	X	X		X	X	X		X
Stone 6	We need to foster more open interfederation. Currently, there are barriers in the form of federation-specific metadata filters and the fact that each federation must support certifications like R&S for SPs. (David Walker, +1 Laura) - also see Stone 12, 7, 5, 13 (percolation of OI DC)					X	X	X	
Stone 7	One working group charge was to provide a statement of purpose for the whole of research, scholarly, and educational federations. We recognize each federation may have internal goals and purposes that are driven by the needs of the communities the federations serve. Extending federated identity beyond the reach of local connections to global interoperation, however, is the promise that the many federations work towards, together. This goal does not have a common brand and or a single voice. We swim in the intention, like fish in water, but naming the obvious and pervasive intention was a challenge. We have settled on labeling this as Academic Interfederation, and the scenarios drove home that dystopian futures can be averted if all the R&E federations can speak with one voice about the value of Academic Interfederation and label it in a recognizable manner. (Judith) See 3, 5, 6 (brand needed)		X	X		X			
Stone 8	(Craig) Follow-up with specific action plans. Actively recruit stakeholders to participate. Key goals: - Drive Suggested Actions into specific plans - Rack and Stack Suggested Actions to identify specific actions that can be effectively supported with available resources (time, money & people) - Find the "sweet spot" in the Suggested Actions that can be done with available resources and will have the most effect in promoting academic federations. - Chase Money Connect academic and societal benefits that are enabled by academic federations Selling infrastructure is always hard, but this connection has to be made - For each of the Suggested Actions, build a matrix of Who are the stakeholders -- Chase Stakeholders - Make this as broad as possible, Academia, Industry, Government How this Action can be connected to a stakeholder benefit Identify specific subtasks to pursue this Action How to support each subtask w/ resources (time, money & people)	X	X		X			X	
Stone 9	The perceived benefits that we provide have shifted. (providing a trusted network > provisioning specific, unique information (attributes) about individuals) We need to evolve to ensure that we remain relevant (Laura Paglione, +1 Dedra) - Also see Stone 21, 4, 31				X			X	X
Stone 10	Expand the benefits of federation to those that don't have the expertise to take advantage of federations in house. (Richard Frovarp) - See Stone 26	X				X		X	X
Stone 11	Leverage the experience gained building national federations to support the growth of industry-specific federations (make the technology we have shown to be successful in R&E relevant in other sectors). Federation as a Service (Dedra, +1 Laura)	X		X	X	X		X	X

Stone Soup Categories		INCLUSIO	LEADERSHIP	"BRANDING"	RELEVANCE & VALUE	EVOLUTION & GROWTH	SUSTAINABILITY	COMPETITIVENESS or AGENCY	PARTNERING
Stone 12	If we don't do it, someone else will (Laura Paglione) - also see Stone 6 , 13, 15, 29, 30 (Multiply Divide, I will survive, Mission Accomplished) Compare to Stone 13		X		X	X		X	X
Stone 13	R&E space used to be up there with the latest tech and advanced ideas....where is OpenID Connect? (Alan, +1 Laura) (Tinder for Research, and Mission Accomplished, Multiply Divide scenario) - Compare to Stone 12, 17, 28, 30				X	X		X	X
Stone 14	It's gotta be easier than this! (Laura Paglione) - also see Stones 10, 11, 16, 21, 24 (I will Survive and Mission Accomplished scenario)				X	X		X	X
Stone 15	On-campus directories going? As institutions move to outsource with Google/MS their directories are now in the cloud (Azure etc service integration) (Alan) - Also See Stone 12 and Stone 17 (I will Survive and Mission Accomplished scenario)				X		X	X	
Stone 16	People are not aware about Federated access. need to create more awareness programs about the Federated Access especially countries like India. (Raja) (+1 Dedra) See 7 (brand needed) See also Stone 20 (Scenario: I will survive, Multiply Divide)	X	X	X		X			
Stone 17	Managed services are not the enemy. Need to provide the kind of services people are looking for (Dedra, +1 Laura, +1 Judith) (Scenario: I Will Survive). Also see Stone 15. Balance this view with Stones 12 and 13, ie, if we don't do it, maybe we should embrace what they do sometimes.				X	X		X	X
Stone 18	Are R&E federations only of use to R&E institutions? Why no adoption for access/single sign-on etc at other levels of education (or colleges/universities with no/low academic research functions)? (Alan, +100 Laura) (brand needed) (Scenario: I will survive, Multiply Divide) Also see Stone 16.	X		X	X	X			
Stone 19	Are national federations the real barrier to world-wide federated access? (Alan) See stone 5		X		X	X	X		
Stone 20	We need to be better at telling success stories for federation, see stone 7 (Dedra) (brand needed)		X	X					X
Stone 21	We keep on getting hooked up on what's wrong with now (and taking that as a 'it won't change') rather than where we want to be and the future we aim for (Alan, +100 Laura) - Also see Stone 9, 5		X		X	X	X		
Stone 22	The key to success is adoption. Be patient, facilitate adoption through collaboration (bottom up over top down) (Dedra, +1 Laura)				X	X		X	X
Stone 23	Future proofing/sustainability? The current Federation people are getting older.... where's the next generation? Who will support what is being done into the future? (Alan) Connect with Stone 21.	X				X	X		
Stone 24	Need balance between making clear decisions on direction and applying resources to execute, and maintaining open-mindedness to changing priorities, marketplaces, technology, and expectations. Don't be rigid about how things have been done in the past, but don't be in constant experimentation mode, either. Transitional technologies and solutions can ease migration from older to newer standards/technologies (Dedra, +100 Laura) - also see Stone 12, Stone 14, stone 24		X			X		X	X
Stone 25	We should be more agnostic to authentication/authorization protocols. (David, +1 Laura, +1 Dedra - See Stone 13)				X	X	X	X	X

Stone Soup Categories		INCLUSIO	LEADERSHIP	"BRANDING"	RELEVANCE & VALUE	EVOLUTION & GROWTH	SUSTAINABILITY	COMPETITIVE or AGENCY	PARTNERING
Stone 26	(Laura) What is the easy (straight-forward) path for implementation? Does complication work against us? - See Stone 10 - More experts needed to do our work (but those new in their career and not choosing this) - Complex configurations needed (but to what end? What would we lose if we remove the complexity?) - Long startup times ("plug and play" solutions are selling their ease of implementation, at least some are choosing this - do we provide a better alternative to the easy path?) - Implementation/engagement out of reach for too many (can we bring them into the community without their technical & engagement overhead going up?) https://xkcd.com/2347/				X	X	X	X	X
Stone 27	There is a distinction between academic (or global) interfederation (perhaps much broader in community than that of some of the R&E federations) - stone 11, 18 - and the specific authorization claims Stone 4 (judith)	X		X	X			X	
Stone 28	Survey current industrial efforts that are relevant to federations, e.g., identity linking capabilities of Radiant Logic. Also See Stone 25, 12, 17, 29, 30 Compare to Stone 13				X		X	X	X
Stone 29	How to leverage commercial efforts and standardization efforts? - Also See Stone 25, 12, 17, 28, 30 Compare to Stone 13		X		X	X	X	X	X
Stone 30	There is a whole ecosystem of different ID solutions out there - are the current federations too isolated from other activities? (Alan)- Also See Stone 25, 29, 12, 17, and Stone 28 Compare to Stone 13	X				X		X	
Stone 31	Trust who? We put a lot of energy to talking about 'trust federations' though there are times when this aspiration falls apart. Do IdPs trust SPs? Does federation A trust federation B? And, what are the conditions of this trust? Is trust really the cornerstone of our offering, or is it something else? (Laura) Stone 4? Stone 9? http://doi.org/10.26869/TI.3.2 Trustmark discussion identifies the multiplicity of contractual assertions that may be needed in academic interfederation that one federation may not be able to assert. Allows asserting a certification independent of a federation's choice to support it.		X	X	X		X	X	
Stone 32	Lead through partnership. (David) CF Stone 10 Also cluster Stone 25, 12, 17, 29, 30		X			X	X		X
Totals		10	15	8	22	24	15	23	18