## Overview

The REFEDS Steering Committee has approved the launch of a consultation on the adoption of the Academia Entity Category by REFEDS. The consultation opened on 12th August 2015 and closed on 23rd September 2015. Participants are invited to review the full text and make change proposals in the table below or by email to the REFEDS Coordinators and to express their support / dissension for the category. It is recommended that you also read the prepared notes on the proposal. This proposal was NOT ACCEPTED. A revised consultation has been launched.

**Please note the full text of the original proposed category is available at:** [https://github.com/leifj/academia-category/blob/master/academia-entity-category.md](https://github.com/leifj/academia-category/blob/master/academia-entity-category.md).  
**The notes are available at:** Academic-Academia.

## Statements of Support / Dissension

As this category has been contentious in the community, we are asking for organisations to express their support or dissension below to allow us to gauge the appropriateness of REFEDS adopting this approach.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Reason</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jim Basney</td>
<td>NCSA / XSEDE (InCommon)</td>
<td><strong>Support:</strong> This is needed by CiLogon to support SeedMe access for academic but not commercial use.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niels van Dijk</td>
<td>GEANT Project; InAcademia Service</td>
<td><strong>Support:</strong> This is needed by the InAcademia Service to support access for academic users, but not others (K12, Homeless IdPs, etc)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romain Wartel</td>
<td>CERN / WLCG</td>
<td><strong>Support:</strong> This would help supporting the needs of the High Energy Physics community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jozef Misulka</td>
<td>LINDAT/CLARIN</td>
<td><strong>Support:</strong> This would simplify filtering out IdPs not meeting our AAI requirements.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Change Log

Change Log for the Consultation on the Academia Entity Category. The Consultation started on 12th August 2015 and closes on 23rd September 2015 (5pm CEST). Please fill in your proposed changes to Academia Category below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Current Text</th>
<th>Proposed Text / Query</th>
<th>Proposer</th>
<th>Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Definition</td>
<td><a href="https://github.com/leifj/academia-category/pull/6">https://github.com/leifj/academia-category/pull/6</a></td>
<td>On GitHub</td>
<td>Raised on github - addressed in forked refeds version.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>a relying party SHOULD NOT assume that an attribute assertion received from an identity provider with the academia entity category represents a Subject as defined in [TBD] with any particular affiliation to the organization on behalf of which the identity provider is operated.</td>
<td>Is this meant to imply &quot;an attribute assertion received *that does not contain an ePA/ePSA provider...&quot;? If &quot;yes&quot;, is the expectation is that the mechanism for membership/publication in a federation will sufficiently address it (e.g. via POPs or the like) ensuring that asserted ePA/ePSA are adhering to expected norms? Or, in the light of the category to allow interpretation of the values of ePA/ePSA based on membership, but still disallowing any absolute meanings to the affiliations?</td>
<td>Eric Goodman</td>
<td>Raised on github - addressed in forked refeds version.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>annotate those member identity providers that represent academic institutions, in order to distinguish them from identity providers that are not able to claim any affiliation with the international research and education community</td>
<td>The definition section sets the bar for degree-granting institutions at ISCED level 6. There are a number of level 5 degree-granting institutions in the US community category that have faculty that participate in national and international research projects, and may be funded by agencies such as the NSF. I'm concerned that the cut-off at level 6 may cause IdPs with participants in international research to be hidden from discovery.</td>
<td>Nick Roy</td>
<td>Raised on github and fixed proposed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.5 any organisation explicitly denoted as an academic institution by a government entity in the jurisdiction where the claim of being an academic institution is made</td>
<td>In the US, accrediting bodies that determine the validity of academic institutions are non-government organizations.</td>
<td>Nick Roy</td>
<td>Raised on github and fixed proposed.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
unless it is being operated

- By or on behalf of and by contract with at least one organization represented by a legal entity in good standing in the community of other academic institutions such that at least one of the criteria below is satisfied.
  - The organization represented by a legal entity in good standing in the community of other academic institutions fulfills at least one of the criteria below.
  - The intended use of the organization represented by a legal entity in good standing in the community of other academic institutions fulfills at least one of the criteria below.

This does allow the category to be applied to contracted-out IdPs that provide service to a mix of educational and non-educational organizations (e.g., Microsoft or Google). It also allows it to be applied to any IdPs that might be operated under unincorporated entities to other organizations. A robust treatment of those use-cases will be needed to work on the wording to ensure that it is only applicable for academic organizations and applications.

Changes to definition/approach

Specifically add Research Hospitals

Research Hospitals are organizations present at least in Italy and France. I propose to list them under the academic organization category. Though I don't know if it is advisable to have a generic or research hospital both on the list, add them as a new item.

They differ from teaching hospitals in that they do not offer courses on their own, nor can they award academic degrees, though they provide laboratories and internships for researchers, and they can host courses with special approval from authorities that do not always agree.

A broad definition that covers both the Italian and the French case is:

Health and research centers where doctors and researchers conduct highly specialized health related researches, and patients can get special treatments.

Currently the term "Research Hospital" is employed for educationOrganizationType in both the Italian and the French Identity Federations: urn:schac:homeOrganizationType:int:researchHospital

Changes to definition

Research Hospitals are organizations present at least in Italy and France. I propose to list them under the academic organization category. Though I don't know if it is advisable to have a generic or research hospital both on the list, add them as a new item.

They differ from teaching hospitals in that they do not offer courses on their own, nor can they award academic degrees, though they provide laboratories and internships for researchers, and they can host courses with special approval from authorities that do not always agree.

A broad definition that covers both the Italian and the French case is:

Health and research centers where doctors and researchers conduct highly specialized health related researches, and patients can get special treatments.

Currently the term "Research Hospital" is employed for educationOrganizationType in both the Italian and the French Identity Federations: urn:schac:homeOrganizationType:int:researchHospital

Specifically add Research Hospitals

Research Hospitals are organizations present at least in Italy and France. I propose to list them under the academic organization category. Though I don't know if it is advisable to have a generic or research hospital both on the list, add them as a new item.

They differ from teaching hospitals in that they do not offer courses on their own, nor can they award academic degrees, though they provide laboratories and internships for researchers, and they can host courses with special approval from authorities that do not always agree.

A broad definition that covers both the Italian and the French case is:

Health and research centers where doctors and researchers conduct highly specialized health related researches, and patients can get special treatments.

Currently the term "Research Hospital" is employed for educationOrganizationType in both the Italian and the French Identity Federations: urn:schac:homeOrganizationType:int:researchHospital
Other Comments / Observations